

Historical and Cultural Values Sites and Areas of Significance to Māori

Section 32 Report for the Proposed Waitomo District Plan

SUMMARY OF ISSUES	RESOURCE MANAGEMENT ACT 1991	NATIONAL DIRECTION	REGIONAL POLICY STATEMENTS	IWI MANAGEMENT PLANS CONT
Sites and areas of significance to Māori are	Section 5 RMA	There are six National Policy Statements (NPSs)	Waikato Regional Policy Statement	A summary of the provisions in the Waikato Tainui
places and features that are of historical, cultural and/or spiritual significance to	Protecting historic heritage is important for people and communities social and cultural wellbeing. For	currently in place:	Objective 3.9 and Section 10 is relevant. Objective 3.9 aims to recognise and provide for the relationship tangata	
Māori. They carry deep levels of meaning	Māori it is particularly important as it recognises the	New Zealand Coastal Policy Statement	whenua have with the environment including the role of	
and association for mana whenua. The	relationship Māori have with their whenua and	2010	tāngata whenua as kaitiaki. Policy 10.1 seeks to provide for	
Resource Management Act 1991 (RMA)	provides a tangible link to tipuna and whakapapa.	NPS for Electricity Transmission 2008	the collaborative, consistent and integrated management	management protocols to be in place in the event wahi
requires Council to recognise and provide		 NPS for Renewable Electricity Generation 	of historic and cultural heritage. Policy 10.2 seeks to	
for the relationship Māori and their culture	Māori (the Māori world view).	2011	recognise and provide for the relationship tangata whenua	accidental discovery protocol included within the plan
and traditions have with their ancestral		NPS for Freshwater Management 2020	have with their culture, traditions and ancestral lands,	assists as it provides a basis for site specific
lands, water, sites, wāhi tapu, and other taonga, as a matter of national importance.	Section 6 RMA Section 6(e) the relationship of Māori and their culture	 NPS on Urban Development 2020 NPS for Highly Productive Land 2022 	water, sites, wāhi tapu and other taonga.	management protocols which can be worked through at the time of resource consent. Objective 16.3.3
taonga, as a matter or national importance.	and traditions with their ancestral lands, water, sites,	NPS for highly productive Land 2022	Implementation methods associated with Policy 10.1 refer	seeks for Waikato -Tainui to manage and/or own all
Extensive consultation and engagement	wāhi tapu and other taonga.	There are also 8 National Environmental	to the Waikato Regional Council facilitating the	
was undertaken with mana whenua (refer	i april i i i i i ji	Standards (NESs) currently in place:	establishment of a regional heritage forum and a regional	and Policy 16.3.3.2 require the development of
to appendix 1 of the introduction to the			heritage inventory. The forum has been established and	
evaluation reports).	provided for within plans. To carry out this	NES for Air Quality 2004	Waitomo District Council have participated in it. A regional	
The ODD identifies 120 sites of sultural	responsibility the Council in preparing this plan must	NES for Sources of Human Drinking Water	heritage inventory is yet to be established. However, the	
The ODP identifies 129 sites of cultural importance and includes 5 wāhi tapu sites	identify and protect the sites and areas of significance to Māori within its district from inappropriate	 2007 NES for Telecommunication Facilities 2016 	sites included within the Plan have been placed into 12 categories and have values statement associated with them	
which are registered with Heritage New	subdivision, use and development.	 NES for Electricity Transmission Activities 	similar to Table 10-2. Consequently, in collaboration with	
Zealand.		2009	tāngata whenua the work completed for this district plan	16.3.3.2 also seek for the delegation of powers and
	Section 7 RMA	 NES for Assessing and Managing 	could be included within a regional heritage inventory when	
The sites and areas of significance to Māori		Contaminants in Soil to Protect Human	it is established.	P10 and SASM-P11 take into account this direction by
Chapter addresses the following issues:	Section 7 lists a range of other matters that particular	Health 2011		seeking to promote formal arrangements of access /
Tenanta when we are besitent about	regard is required to be given to.	NES for Plantation Forestry 2017	Implementation methods associated with Policy 10.2 of	
 Tāngata whenua are hesitant about sharing the location and values of 	Section 7(a) Kaitiakitanga	 NES for Freshwater 2020 NES for Storing Tyres Outdoors 2021 	particular relevance include 10.2.3 which states local authorities should work with tangata whenua to identify	options for Māori and by Māori solutions including the transfer of powers. No amendments to the accidental
some sites.	Section 7(a) Kalilakitanga		opportunities to maintain or enhance their relationship	
While there were some sites of	Mana whenua are the kaitiaki or spiritual guardian of		within their rohe through the recognition, protection, or	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
significance identified in the ODP it is	the sites. This matter requires regard to be given to	No NPS or NES specifically relate to this topic.	maintenance of cultural landscapes. Through the	
not clear what the values of the sites	providing for this relationship.		development of the plan in collaboration with tangata	
are.		Relevant case law considered	whenua sites of significance rather than landscapes have	
The location and extent of the sites identified on the ODB is problematic as	Section 7(b) the efficient use and development of	Council has reviewed relevant Environment Court	been developed. Consequently, the district plan does not	
identified on the ODP is problematic as it is not clear where the boundaries	natural and physical resources.	cases regarding heritage, specifically:	include cultural landscapes rather specific sites have been identified. Some of the sites overlap with other values	
are.	This matter includes the efficient use and	Tainui Hapu v Waikato DC A075/96 (PT)	including natural landscape values and outstanding natural	additional information will be held by tangata whenua
Inappropriate subdivision, use or	development of land and buildings. The identification	Independent Māori Statutory Board v Auckland	features.	and made available through the consultation process
development of a site can affect	of sites and areas of significance to Maori will affect	Council [2017] NZHC 356		in the event of an application affecting a site.
cultural values, such as degradation	the way in which land can be developed. This matter	Blakeley Pacific Ltd v Western Bay of Plenty	Manawatu-Whanganui One Plan	Additionally, a process for accidental discovery has
and loss of the site.	provides direction to accurately identify heritage	District Council [2011] NZEnvC 354	Objective 2-1 requires kaitaikitanga to be given particular	been provided for. Furthermore, policy provisions
 Scheduling sites can places an administrative cost on landowners and 	values.	This case law provides direction on the importance	regard to and for relationship of hapū and iwi with their ancestral lands, water, sites, wāhi tapu and other taonga	
administrative cost on landowners and occupiers.	Section 7 (g) Any finite characteristics of natural and		(including wāhi tūpuna) to be recognised and provided for	10.3.3.2.
 Some sites have been identified where 	physical resources	provide protection. In Tainui Hapu v Waikato	through resource management processes. Policy 2-2	Mana whenua representatives of Tainui were
areas have been closely subdivided	r / · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	District Council case the general area concerned	requires district plans to identify wahi tapu, wahi tupuna	
and have a number of buildings	The scheduled sites carry deep level of meaning and	was protected in the district plan. The fact the	and other sites of significance to Māori and protect those	sites.
located on them. Balancing protection	association for mana whenua. When the site is	area was protected enabled the Environment Court	sites from inappropriate, subdivision, use and	
of cultural values while enabling	altered or destroyed the tangible and intangible		development. This outcome has been achieved though the	
appropriate development where appropriate.	meaning and association can be lost. Subdivision use and development of the sites can result in permanent	spiritual values irrespective of the degree of effect of the activity. In the High Court decision of the	development of the district plan and the identification of sites in SCHED3, SCHED4 and SCHED5 and shown on the	
	loss which does not recognise and provide for the	Independent Māori Statutory Board v Auckland	planning maps and the provisions in the sites and areas of	
	outcomes in section 6(e) of the RMA.	Council the High Court found the Independent	significance to Māori chapter.	
OPERATIVE WAITOMO DISTRICT		Hearings Panel had not erred in law in withdrawing	IWI MANAGEMENT PLANS	OTHER RELEVANT PLANS OR LEGISLATION
PLAN	Section 8 RMA	the SVMW overlay. The key outcome is to take care		
The list of regulatory methods in	Section 8 requires all people exercising functions and	in identifying the sites and to have certainty	The Council is required to take into account planning	
Chapter 21 explains in (d) that additional heritage sites are shown on	powers under the RMA to take into account the principles of Te Tiriti o Waitangi. Over time the	regarding their values. In Blakeley the Court found the application on the site was not suitable for a	documents recognised by an iwi authority and lodged with the territorial authority (section 74(2A)).	(HNZPT) 2014 is directly relevant to this section of the Plan. This Act establishes:
the planning maps being sites of	principles have been developed by the Courts and	number of reasons including the site was ancestral		• a framework to recognise places of historical,
cultural importance to Māori, natural	Waitangi Tribunal and are:	land containing water wāahi tapu site and other	A summary of the provisions in the Maniapoto Iwi	cultural and ancestral significance and provides
features, bush remnants, and	The principles of partnership	taonga some of which would have been destroyed	Environment Management Plan 2018 (MEMP) relevant to	criteria for places to be included on Heritage List /
individual trees.	The principle of active protection	by the development and others where access for	the protection of Historic Heritage are as follows:	Rārangi korero; and
• Rule 21.6.2.3 requires resource	The principle of redress	tangata whenua would have been impeded. The	Maniapoto seek to participate at the highest levels of	overarching protection and a regulatory process
consent for a Discretionary Activity	These principles are inherently important for this	Court decided to allow the appeal from tangata whenua and cancelled the consent.	decision making for matters that affect cultural heritage	for land occupied pre-1900.
when any identified Heritage Site on the Planning Maps is altered or	section of the proposed plan. The principles of		(Objective 10.3.1). Policy 10.3.1.1 seeks to protect wāhi tapu and sites of significance through district plans and	The places included on the Heritage List do not
destroyed.	partnership is the duty to make informed decisions.		access to sites. Maniapoto representatives have been	automatically have protection from alteration or
	This includes acting in good faith and will in most		partners in the approach taken to identify sites and areas	
	cases require consultation. The principle of active		of significance to Maori. This process has resulted in the	plans provide for protection from such activities.
	protection requires positive steps to be taken to		identification of 165 sites. Ngati Maniapoto and the Council	Within the ODP there are 5 wāhi tapu areas as well as

matters in this chapter this includes identifying sites and areas of significance and managing effects on these values through the resource consent process.			
SCALE & SIGNIFICANCE #32(1)(c) The assessment is based on eight factors outlined in terms of its scale and significance (where 1 is low and 5 is high). Reson for Change: 2 Problem 1 is scale and significance (where 1 is low and 5 is high). Reson for Change: 2 Problem 1 is scale and significance (where 1 is low and 5 is high). Reson for Change: 2 Problem 1 is scale and significance (where 1 is low and 5 is high). Reson for Change: 2 Degree of Sint from Status Quo: 2 Used on therest of a percent scale and significance (where 1 is low and 5 is high). Reson for Change: 2 Degree of Sint from Status Quo: 2 Type of Flect: 3 Type of Sink or Uncertainty: 3 Total (out of 40): 23 Total (out of 40): 23	The assessment is based on eight factors outlined in Ministry for the Environment's guidance on Section 32 reports. Each factor is scored in terms of its scale and significance (where 1 is low and 5 is high). Reason for Change: 2 Problem / Issue: 2 Degree of Shift from Status Quo: 2 Who and How Many Affected, Geographic Scale of Effects: 3 Degree of Impact on or Interest from Māori: 5 Timing and Duration of Effects: 3 Type of Effect: 3 Degree of Risk or Uncertainty:3	matters in this chapter this includes identifying sites and areas of significance and managing effects on these values through the resource consent process.	The MEMP also seeks for appropriate protocols place in respect of accidental discovery (Objecti and Policy 10.3.3.1). The sites and areas of signi Māori chapter an accidental discovery protoc purpose of the protocol is to make people awar responsibilities under the Heritage New Zealand Taonga Act 2014. It contains the steps to be for the event of an accidental discovery. The step notifying the appropriate iwi groups or kaitiaki authority over the process. No amendment accidental discovery protocol were requested of

OBJECTIVE(S) s32(1)(a)

Relevance – The proposed objectives recognise and provide for the protection of sites and areas of significance to Maori. The objectives are directly relevant to section 6(e) of the RMA a matter of national importance, and directly addresses the issues above

Usefulness – The objectives provide clarity as to what is to be achieved under section 104 when considering a resource consent application for any site included within SCHED3, SCHED4, or SCHED5. The objectives also make it clear that work is ongoing and additional sites may be added to the district plan over time. the objectives are also useful as they emphasize key matters that need to be taken into account from the principles of the Treaty of Waitangi. The objectives provide an overall framework that identifies key matters which need to be managed through the provisions. The provisions provide guidance as to what is appropriate subdivision, use or development.

ng sites is hanges to Maniapoto drafting of sites from In nent. r not the oapakāinga led site as with their sites and tified sites sites have rely on the posed plan henua for posed plan penefits lot osed plan. h seeks to iori, which led sites whenua to

s to be in tive 10.3.3 hificance to col. The are of their d Pouhere followed in eps include who have ts to the during the

of current naeological his is that changing. naeological essed from nonthly. In formation, unintended e is made Māori and

taken into have been provide for sion use or e Plan seek to anagement protocol is heritage buildings on the list. In terms of overarching protection some registered archaeological sites are also identified sites or areas of significance to Māori In these situations, an authority from Heritage New Zealand and a resource consent under the provisions of this chapter of the Plan may be required.

Section 74(2)(b)(iia) of the RMA requires in undertaking a plan review a territorial authority shall have regard to any relevant entry on the New Zealand Heritage List/Rārangi Kōrero required by the HNZPT Act. Regard has been had to the list in the preparation of this plan. The wāhi tapu areas have been included in SCHED4 and identified on the planning maps where there is possible. For some sites the area identified on the planning maps is different than the HNZPT listing. The reason for this is that, on the advice of mana whenua, the boundaries of some sites have been revised through the district plan process Refer to Section 32 for Historic Heritage in respect of Heritage buildings and structures on the HNZPT List.

STRATEGIC DIRECTION

The following objective from the Strategic Directions Chapter of the plan is relevant to this topic:

- **SD-O1:** Uphold the partnership principles inherent within Te Tiriti o Waitangi by ensuring mana whenua are enabled to maintain and enhance the well-being (mauri) and health (hauora) of both people and the environment and empowered in the expression and application of kaitiakitanga.
- SD-O3: Mana whenua are able to exercise customary activities, protect, develop and use Māori land in a way that is consistent with their culture and traditions and provides for their social and economic aspirations.
- **SD-018:** Consider the transfer of functions, powers or duties to Iwi Authorities under section 33 of the RMA where this provides for improved efficiencies, environmental and social benefits.

UNCERTAINTIES AND RISKS s32(2)(c)

The degree of risk and uncertainty is low-medium. The risk is low for the sites that have been identified as their location is certain. There are sites that have not been identified in the plan as notified and the risk of sites being modified or destroyed in this situation is higher. In order to manage this risk work on identifying sites is ongoing and the plan encourages applicants to consult with tāngata whenua early in the development process. The most up to date information on archaeological sites is also available on the Council's website which may assist in some situations.

Reasonableness – The objectives do not create unjustifiably high costs for the community. The proposed list of sites in SCHED3, SCHED4 and SCHED5 identify sites and areas of cultural importance, many of which were not identified on the planning maps in the ODP. The SCHEDs and maps in the proposed plan are a lot clearer than what was provided in the ODP, as they define the boundaries of the site. Identifying the boundaries of the sites provides more certainty for landowners. SCHED5 cultural alert layer areas contain the sites that have been developed and have a number of buildings on them (Appendix 2 sets out the requirements for preparing a cultural impact assessment, which will enable landowners and developers to clearly understand the information that must be submitted when preparing an assessment). By placing these sites in SCHED5 it recognises the values of the site as well as the development that has occurred. The information in the proposed plan schedules also explain the values of each site and that information was not included in the ODP. During the draft district plan consultation process landowners where notified, some of whom provided feedback to the Council. Through this process some sites have been removed and the boundaries of other sites have been amended. It is envisaged that this process will continue through the submissions and hearing phase of the proposed plan.

PROVISIONS \$32(1)(b)

Achievability - The objectives are achievable as they place importance on protection of sites and areas of significance to Maori consistent with section 6(e) and section 8 and the provisions specify how the objective is to be achieved.

Are the objectives the most appropriate way to achieve the Purpose of the Act?

EFFICIENCY & EFFECTIVENESS s32(1)(b)(ii), 32(2)(a)(i), s32(2)(a)(i)

- The proposed objectives are considered to meet the tests of relevance, usefulness, reasonableness and achievability. The objectives are the most appropriate way to achieve the purpose of the RMA because they: • Will provide for the protection of natural and physical resources in this case land that has cultural values. In doing so it will enable people and communities to provide for their cultural wellbeing (section 5) and promote the protection of cultural values for present and future generations (section 5(2)(c)); and
 - Will address the requirement of section 6(e) to recognise and provide for the relationship of Maori and their culture and traditions with their ancestral lands, water, sites, wahi tapu and other taonga; and
 - Is within the jurisdiction of the Council and can be achieved within the exercise of its functions; and
 - The objectives will address the key resource management issues identified above.

i)	

Benefits Anticipated

Environmental

The environmental benefits are inherent in the holistic Maori world view of environment, as by protecting sites and areas of significance, the wairua of the environment will be maintained. •

Economic

- The definition of sites and their boundaries will have administrative benefits over and above the provisions of the ODP and in that regard will be more efficient.
- By including sites within a cultural alert layer that already have high to reasonably high levels of development, it means that people who live in these locations are made aware of the significance of the area but are not subject to additional resource consent requirements.
- By providing guidelines for preparing cultural impact assessments, this should aid in ensuring consistency in the assessments, and cost efficiency, as the requirements for what is required in the assessment have been specified.
- Removal of the blanket discretionary activity rule in the ODP for all Heritage Sites, with a list of permitted activities will reduce the level of regulatory control making it clear what activity is permitted and what requires consent. This approach is more administratively efficient and effective than the provisions in the ODP.

Social and Cultural

- The identified sites have deep levels of meaning and association for tangata whenua. The protection of these sites is important for the cultural wellbeing of present and future generations.
- The identification of sites is an efficient and effective way to promote the reconnection of mana whenua to ancestral lands, sites and other taonga (section 6(e)). The protection of these sites is also important for kaitiakitanga.
- The protection of sites of significance also takes into account the principles of the Treaty of Waitangi, particularly the principle of active protection.
- By including the accidental discovery protocol in the Plan, it makes it clear what processes need to be followed in the event an accidental discovery is made.
- The provisions also provide mana whenua with authority over how the sites are developed by making marae complexes and papakāinga housing developments a permitted activity.

Costs Anticipated

Environmental

It is unlikely there will be any environmental costs from these provisions.

Economic

- There is the potential lost opportunity cost for landowners where a site or area of significance has been identified. It will depend on individual circumstances, for instance if the site is also an archaeological site, then the site could not be developed anyway. The Council where appropriate will offset some of these costs by preparing cultural impact assessments for some sites particularly where there are a number of landowners involved.
- There will be consenting costs where applicants wish to undertake activities that do not meet the rules, including permitted standards.

Social and cultural

It is unlikely there will be social and cultural costs from these provisions there is likely to benefits.

Economic growth and employment opportunities

These provisions will likely have a nil impact on economic growth and employment opportunities.

Ouantification of benefits and costs

Section 32(2)(b) requires that, where practicable, the benefits and costs of a proposal are to be quantified. Given the assessment of the proposed provisions, specific quantification of the benefits and costs in this report is considered neither necessary, beneficial nor practicable in relation to this topic.

ALTERNATIVES s32(1)(b)(i)

For the purpose of this evaluation, the Council has considered the following potential options: 1. The proposed provisions; and

2. The status quo.

For the reasons included in this evaluation the ODP provisions are not considered to be efficient or effective in achieving the objectives.

In order to identify other reasonably practicable options, the Council has undertaken the following:

- Reviewed other relevant district plan provisions for sites and areas of significance to Māori.
- Discussed options for provisions with mana whenua representatives.
- Sought feedback from staff at HNZPT on the provisions in the sites and areas of significance to Māori chapter.
- Consulted on a draft district plan and engaged directly with landowners affected by the sites and areas of significance to Māori provisions and overlays.

EFFICIENCY & EFFECTIVENESS s32(1)(b)(ii)	REASONS FOR PROVISIONS s32(1)(b)(iii)
Section 32(1)(b)(ii) requires assessing the efficiency and effectiveness of the provisions in achieving the objectives:	Section 32(1)(b)(iii) requires a summary of the reasons for deciding on the provision
Efficiency The proposed provisions have considerably more benefits, and clearly set out the acceptable activities with no or minimal effects as well as those which require closer assessment through the consenting process. The package of provisions will be efficient in achieving the objectives. Landowners that have a site or area of significance to Māori on their property have also been notified. The majority of queries had been addressed at the time of the proposed plan's notification.	The proposed provisions are the most appropriate approach to achieve the objective higher order policy documents, including being consistent with the purpose and priprinciples of the Treaty of Waitangi and the two iwi management plans. It is a funct section 6 of the RMA. These matters include recognising and providing for the relation other taonga (section 6(e)). The provisions are consistent with the higher order policy this Plan. The cultural and social benefits of protecting sites and areas of significance to achieve the objective.
 <u>Effectiveness</u> The proposed provisions are the most effective in achieving the objectives as they directly address the resource management issues and the outcomes sought through the objectives. The provisions are consistent with the purpose and principles of the RMA and recognise and provide for section 6(e). The proposed provisions are considered to be the most effective means of achieving the objectives as together they will: give effect to both the RPS's objectives and policies; and take into account direction in iwi management plans; and enable the Council to fulfil its statutory obligations, including section 6(e), 7(a), 7(b), and 7(g) and is consistent with its functions under section 31 of the RMA; and ensure adverse effects on sites and areas of significance to Māori are managed appropriately by clearly stating the activities that are permitted being those that will have minimal effect on the identified site and areas, and requiring consent for activities that could cause adverse effects; and enable the Council to effectively administer its district plan and to monitor the outcomes of the proposed provisions in a clear and consistent manner. Appendix 2 contains a Cultural Impact Assessment Process which provides guidance for applicants applying for resource consents where this type of evaluation is required. 	The recommended policies and rule requirements assessed in this report are the mo- having considered other reasonably practicable options and having assessed the efficient

ons:

ctives of this Chapter. The provisions appropriately give effect to principles of the RMA. The provisions also take into account the unction of the Council to recognise and provide for the matters in lationship of Māori with their ancestral lands, water wāhi tapu and plicy documents for this matter to be investigated during the life of the to Māori, while controlling potential adverse effects will effectively

most appropriate to achieve the objectives for the proposed plan, ficiency and effectiveness of the provisions.